Differentiated Instruction in the Latin Classroom Author(s): Teresa Ramsby and Allyson Spencer-Bunch Source: *The Classical Outlook*, 2020, Vol. 95, No. 2 (2020), pp. 45-55 Published by: American Classical League Stable URL: https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.2307/26974032

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at https://about.jstor.org/terms



 $American\ Classical\ League$ is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to The Classical Outlook

Differentiated Instruction in the Latin Classroom: Feasibility and Best Practices

Teresa Ramsby University of Massachusetts Amherst tramsby@classics.umass.edu

Allyson Spencer-Bunch John F. Kennedy Middle School, Northampton, MA aspencerbunch@northampton-k12.us

The purpose of this article is to provide teachers with information related to differentiated instruction in the Latin classroom. The methods shared here are ones the authors themselves have used or methods that have been shared with the authors by several instructors based mostly in New England. We will begin by explaining the origins of differentiated instruction and then launch into a compilation of methods that we hope will be useful to the readers of this journal.

The phrase "differentiated instruction" (referred to as "DI" below) was coined by educator Carol Ann Tomlinson who, in the 1990s, was struggling to teach English Language Arts to a class in which one student could not read, while another student was capable of analysis of textual symbolism. Between those two students existed students of a range of abilities, and the curriculum with which she was working was not a perfect fit for any of them. Over time, she formulated strategies for teaching English to all her students using, as she puts it, "learning contracts and tiering and a way to handle spelling and vocabulary in classes where student reading readiness inevitably stretched from first grade to college level" (Tomlinson, 2009: vii-viii). Since her discoveries, shared in several volumes published starting in 1995, Tomlinson has influenced an entire generation of educators who strive to make it possible that students of various learning styles and abilities, students with a potentially wide range of behavioral challenges, and students with varying degrees of English competency can learn together in the same classroom.¹

The idea that students should spend their class time among peers of equal cognitive and learning abilities has been challenged by the notion that blended learning environments are both feasible and preferable (Blaz, 5-7). In these dynamic learning spaces, all students receive the type of instruction they need for the types of concepts they are ready to learn, using the media (technological or otherwise) appropriate to that learning. As a result, educational equity can be better achieved, and schools can avoid the potentially devastating results of cordoning off those students who are perceived to have learning disabilities from the rest of the school population.

Tomlinson and Imbeau, in their volume on managing the DI classroom, state that the "core of the classroom practice of differentiation is the modification of four curriculum-related elements: content, process, product, and affect (which are based on categories of student need and variance...)" (2010, 15). By "content," the authors refer to the knowledge students should acquire, with the additional caveat that teachers should first provide variation in ways that students can access the content, with change in content only occurring when students require it. By "process," the authors refer to the sense-making activities through which students come to understand the content. By "product," the authors refer to the ways that students demonstrate their understanding, or assessments, with effective assessments being those that provide students complex problems that require understanding to resolve. By "affect," the authors refer to the emotional states that impact student learning. As stated above, those four elements can be shaped in response to student needs.

This expansive palette on which teaching methods must be formulated and blended may seem daunting, but it is important to note that teachers have an important role in diagnosing what their students need, selecting carefully, and eschewing unnecessary options. Moreover, this list of elements can be simplified. In her volume on DI for world language teachers, Deborah Blaz offers a list of key beliefs and practices that enable successful implementation of DI: student choice in what they learn; student collaboration; clear communication of expectations; connections between new learning and previous learning; multiple learning modes (a catch-all category for the many ways teachers make learning happen); open-endedness; routine; and collegiality among teachers and other professionals (Blaz, 3-5). By means of lists like this one, the application of DI enters the realm of feasibility.

Even so, one of the biggest hurdles to differentiation is the time required to make separate modifications for different groups of learners. Many teachers, therefore, focus on Universal Design for Learning (UDL), modifications or strategies that can be provided to the whole class, and that are designed to remove obstacles for certain groups of students. By providing scaffolding that eliminates common difficulties, teachers can reach all students' needs with fewer individual accommodations. UDL is explained on many websites, and we point the reader to the online article by Amanda Morin as a good place to learn about this concept (Morin, 2014). We also point the reader to the website of the Center for Applied Special Technology, the pioneering organization in the development of UDL principles (www.cast. org). An analogy that effectively communicates the basic idea is closed-captioning for videos. Designed initially for the hearing-impaired, closed captions are popular, as well, among many who are not hearing impaired, for a variety of reasons. The essential aspect of UDL is that it presents a learning environment designed to be accessible and comprehensible to the greatest number of students.

Due to the complexity of student needs and of the solutions that exist, teachers need help finding and formulating specific methods that work for their students. This article is an attempt to discuss how differentiated instruction can work in the Latin classroom. In preparation for this piece, the authors requested summaries of best practices in DI from colleagues and also offer some of their own ideas in order to present to you some suggestions about how you can achieve a classroom where varied learning needs can be met to the advantage of all involved. Our list is not meant to be a comprehensive one, but rather an index of strategies shared with us as well as our own. Strategies are presented within the following functional categories: a) setting up the classroom; b) working with Latin and grammatical concepts; and c) assessment.

A. Setting up the DI Classroom: There are numerous ways to create a learning environment in which all students have a greater capacity to learn. That can include setting up your room in a way that encourages easy transitions to group learning by way of eliminating desks and placing tennis balls on chair legs so that chairs can be easily and noiselessly moved for group gatherings. This can mean setting up a cozy corner within the classroom where students who need or simply wish to retire from class activities for a time (to read or think about something) can do so comfortably. This might entail setting up a rack where distracting devices (smartphones, popular toys) can be safely relinquished by all students upon entering the room. This might also include having folders or writing tablets for every student in the classroom, which students pick up when they enter the room and leave behind when class ends, so that no student is ever without necessary resources for the day. Below are four ideas regarding set-up and organization, labeled with Tomlinson's elements of DI relevant to each.

1. Class Jobs (Affect)

What: Assigning class jobs to students, particularly those easily distracted or those with diagnosed attention deficits, can also create a better learning environment for everyone. Class jobs take some of the tasks that make your classroom run smoothly and assign them to appropriate students. Teachers can take volunteers or have students apply for these jobs. Allyson Spencer-Bunch (Latin teacher at John F. Kennedy Middle School, MA, and co-author of this article) grants jobs to students who need a task to focus upon. For example, a student who needs to move might manage the door, windows, projector screen, or lights, or might be an actor in stories. Another student might be responsible for counting how often a Latin word is repeated in class (for the sake of learning vocabulary through repeated use) or tracking how long the class stays in Latin for a particular spoken Latin assignment.

Students who finish work quickly or crave extra challenges can have a job to create materials for the class. Kelsie Toy (Lynnfield High School, MA) has her students write Quizlets or Kahoot and Gimkit games that define new vocabulary words in Latin and create paraphrases of stories, all of which she then uses in class. Students can also create stories in Latin, with or without help; and when the teacher presents a story in class, a student can monitor the progress of the story's reception: keeping track of the number of requests for repetition or questions about particular vocabulary words. Emily Berardi (Newton Country Day School, MA) occasionally places students in pairs in such a way that a student with more skills works with a student with fewer skills. In this subtle designation of jobs, students offer their expertise to help their peers learn the material.

Why: Jobs are empowering for students and help them take ownership of the classroom. Students who feel ownership "tend to work more cooperatively with teachers and are more motivated to meet their academic challenges" (Sousa and Tomlinson, 24). Jobs can also fill a need, like creating challenge or movement opportunities, or they can highlight a student's special skills. Jobs also ease some administrative tasks that a teacher would normally do, creating more time and mental space to think about differentiating in other ways.

Resources: As a starting point, Ben Slavic (who teaches French) and Bryce Hedstrom (who teaches Spanish) provide lists of potential student jobs on their websites: https://www.benslavic.com/jobs-for-kids.html and https://www.brycehedstrom.com/wp-content/uploads/ CLASSROOM-JOBS-2.pdf. Tina Hargaden, an ESOL teacher in Portland, OR, includes a section on classroom jobs in her forthcoming volume, *Stepping Stones: Year One and Beyond*, currently available in draft form at this site: https://ci-liftoff.teachable.com/p/stepping-stones-beyond-year-one.

2. Create a Safety Net (Affect / Process)

What a safety net is: A safety net is a word or phrase or gesture that students use to signal for support. Posting these words in the classroom or starting the year with information on safety nets provides necessary structure and support to students without requiring separate materials.

Why: These safety net phrases and signals ensure that if a student gets lost, or needs to ask for help, they have a structured and practiced system to use. These signals and words allow students to ask teachers to slow down, go back over something, or clarify the meaning of a word without bringing a lot of attention to themselves or requiring them to think up original requests on their own. They also provide scaffolding for students who want to speak in Latin but need some prompting. The placement of helpful words on your classroom walls (interrogatives, common conjunctions and adverbs, and updated, key vocabulary) encourages all students to participate in spoken activities. Posting these phrases in Latin and pausing to point at them when you say them makes it more likely that all students will understand the Latin and make attempts to respond to it.

Resources: Sites providing instruction on individual American Sign Language signs are abundant. WhereAre YourKeys.org, created by Evan Gardner, is an impressive site that provides a language learning methodology based on movement and signs, and, under the "Resources" tab on the homepage, offers a list of user-approved ASL sites. The WAYK methodology, explained in a series of videos (https://whereareyourkeys.org/introduction-towayk-video-series/), is an intriguing option for language instruction utilizing aspects of DI.

3. Silent Sustained Reading (SSR) / Free Voluntary Reading (FVR) (Content)

What: This is an increasingly common form of differentiation in the Latin classroom. Teachers set aside a certain amount of class time per week for independent reading. During this time, students choose a Latin book or text that is appropriate to their level, which means (in line with Stephen Krashen's Comprehension Hypothesis) it contains vocabulary with which they are at least 95% familiar so that reading ease is facilitated (Krashen, 15-29). Near the time of this article's publication, there were fifty-five novellas written for Latin learners at various levels of reading proficiency. Teachers can also print their own booklets of class stories or print stories from the Mille Noctes database, which offers a vast array of free Latin stories created by teachers. Teachers who have extra space within a classroom might consider creating a reading area with bean bag chairs and a *novella* rack so that students can access any book they wish to read in a comfortable place.

Why: Students are able to read Latin at their own pace, at a level that is good for them, and on a topic that interests them. Some students who aren't confident readers might choose to reread textbook passages, to read booklets of stories they've already done in class, or to read a book from a level lower than their current one. The teacher should also consider reading a book to the whole class, stopping frequently to assess for comprehension and to answer questions. Audiobooks provide another means of scaffolding the reading experience whereby students can listen to new stories, or stories they already know, as they read along. Students for whom your whole-class readings might seem too easy can choose a harder novella or experience the satisfaction of being able to quickly read several easier books.

Resources: There are many blog posts and conference sessions on how to acquire books and how to launch and maintain a successful FVR program. *Mille Noctes* is available here: http://www.latinteachertoolbox.com/ mille-noctes-texts.html. Lance Piantaggini maintains an up-to-date list of the Latin novellas that have been published so far, with links for purchase: https://magisterp.com/novellas/. John Piazza offers FVR resources on his site: http://johnpiazza.net/storybook-presentation/. Mike Peto provides a cartoon template into which you can place the stories your students create for FVR exercises: https://mygenerationofpolyglots. com/2017/06/18/how-to-add-15-new-beginner-leveltexts-to-your-classroom-library-every-week/. Peto also has a self-published book on the topic of FVR: *Pleasure Reading in the World Language Classroom* (2018). See also Dan Stoa's blog with self-directed reading activities: https://comprehensibleantiquity.com/free-volunteerreading/. Bryce Hedstrom and Alina Filapescu frequently present at conferences on the topic of FVR, and have blog posts on making independent reading sustainable: https://www.brycehedstrom.com/free-stuff/reading and https://tprsforchinese.blogspot.com/2018/01/ssrfvrreading-program.html.

4. Predictability (Process / Affect)

What: A well-organized learning environment is one in which students know what to expect. Randomness and chaos do not coincide with good pedagogy. To be clear, occasional pleasant surprises in class or the introduction of new activities do have their place in the classroom, but a teacher should strive to provide patterns of activity in all aspects of the class, whether it be learning activities or assessments. In the K-12 or college classroom, this might mean that assessments take a regular form, and any new forms of assessment are introduced well in advance with examples provided. This might mean that learning concepts and review always take place before an assessment, and that review takes a consistent form in keeping with the assessment to come, so that students can be certain that what they review has relevance to the assessment they will be expected to complete. Primarily, predictability means that once you have introduced an activity or concept to your students, they can expect to see it again.

Teresa Ramsby (faculty member at UMass Amherst Classics, and co-author of this article) provides a review sheet before a written exam that includes all possible prompts that could appear on the test. She also allows her students to bring 3x5 notecards to their written exams with anything written on them. This practice assures them that whatever they have reviewed and prepared in advance will be useful on the exam itself. Students come to their exams with these notecards often covered in tiny print; Ramsby notes they rarely use them during the test. The students are so well prepared and assured by the extent of and access to their review that they write the exams with much less anxiety and stress, and with much greater confidence and ability. She reports that the exams themselves tend to be not only more complete and well written, but much more enjoyable to read.

Why: Predictability in your classroom is evidence that you have thought about the goals of your class, and that

you have structured your class in relation to those goals, and organized your activities in such a way that students can associate their progress in your class with the structures you have put in place.

Resources: "Backward Design" is a significant pedagogical planning method that emerged in the 1990s, and that many school districts throughout the nation are using as a governing principle in curriculum creation or discussing in professional development training. The essential idea behind it is that if teachers specify the goals of their course and the achievements that their students should gain from the course, then they can more effectively design their courses to match those stated objectives. This website provides a comprehensive list of resources on this topic: http://www.ascd.org/ research-a-topic/understanding-by-design-resources. aspx#books.

B. Working with Latin and Latin Texts and Presenting Grammar in the DI Classroom: The approaches and activities relevant to these aspects of our pedagogical practice are myriad. The authors present to you here seven ideas that best represent the basic applications of differentiated instruction and that can be adapted and complicated in a variety of ways to suit the needs of your students. Aspects of Active Latin, and all the pedagogical components of it, including Comprehensible Input (CI), are significantly represented in this section, given that one of the authors (Allyson Spencer-Bunch), and many of the teachers consulted for this article, use methods in line with this theoretical perspective. Even so, there are aspects of all these activities that all Latin teachers could borrow from and implement in their classrooms.

1. Read Texts Out Loud to Students (Content / Process)

What: Read Latin stories and texts (even assessments) out loud to students or preview written texts with a short oral version of the story. This may seem self-evident, but how often do we feel that, in the interests of time, reading the Latin is just one more onerous task? Perhaps we get discouraged because when we ask our students to read Latin aloud it does the class no good; unless prompted to read correctly and with understanding, students tend to read Latin in a flat, monotone voice, with mispronunciations abounding and meaning completely lost. That activity is probably not worth pursuing. When the teacher reads the Latin aloud purposefully, however, with correct stresses and pronunciation, with feeling, and with emphasis on par-

ticular words that point students to meaning and understanding, a great deal can be accomplished. Students may see the words as having power and meaning this way, and may begin to piece together the sense and even explicit meanings of the words, phrases, sentences, and story being presented. In other words, hearing Latin as a language, students may begin to understand it as one. Reading text aloud, like closed captioning on videos, is clearly relevant to UDL.

Why: Mariah Lapiroff (East Longmeadow High School, MA) states, "reading out loud is helpful to my students with reading disabilities, to ELL students, and to other students who struggle with reading in English: language literacy skills are transferable." John Berneche (English teacher at Granby Jr. / Sr. High School, MA), for about 10-15 minutes in each class, plays an audio version (from an online resource or one that he himself has recorded) of the passage to be discussed that day. The students read along silently while the audiobook plays, and after that, discussion begins. Berneche reports great success with this method: students who have not read it before (for whatever reason) have now read it, and are prepared for discussion; students who did read the passage before, on their own, have a chance to gain new insights from the passage.

Gregory Stringer (Burlington High School, MA) conducts the same pre-reading activities for everyone in the class, but, as he put it, "ramps up or down the expectations to meet students where they are at." During a listening activity, he might allow a less experienced student to have the text in front of them, while asking the more advanced student to rely solely on their ears. While reviewing a read passage, he provides a fill-in-theblank passage ("cloze activity"), and expects the relevant vocabulary words from one student, but the proper syntactic forms of those words from a more advanced student.

When teachers read compelling content in Latin aloud, they model both the expressive articulation and the pronunciation of the language for their students. Eventually, as they progress in the language, those students who demonstrate an interest in reading Latin aloud with expertise can assume this responsibility in class – another class job (see above) that correlates to the student's strengths.

2. Self-rating: Let Students Choose Whether They Need Your Support (Process)

What: After previewing a text, perhaps reading it

aloud to the class, ask students to self-evaluate their comfort level. Students who rate themselves as confident could read by themselves or with a partner and complete a task using the text. Students who rate themselves as needing support can then work with the teacher on the text in a small group.

Alternatively, students who need more repetition of the vocabulary may be directed to read a parallel story, or do another input-focused activity, while the teacher presents a challenging grammatical concept to the faster-processing students. Then these students will have the capability to spot that grammatical concept in stories, or use it in their own writing. While some students are focused on the primary learning target of understanding the text, others are working at a level more appropriate to their broader understanding of linguistic concepts.

Why: These sessions using a self-rating system help students monitor their own capabilities while they make sense of the text, and the sessions also give the teacher an awareness of where the gaps in understanding lie. Then the teacher can fold in more whole-class or small-group instruction to reinforce the concepts some students haven't acquired. Mariah Lapiroff shared with the authors her perspective on the effectiveness of this: "This method allows those who are further along in their skills development to continue building their confidence, skills, and independence, while also giving those who may feel they are falling behind more personalized attention. This method also lessens the need for students who suffer anxiety or shyness to request that I adjust the pace or to ask questions in front of the group."

3. Modify Text Formatting (Process / Affect)

What: Instead of single-spaced paragraphs in 12-point font, teachers can present texts double-spaced in a large sans-serif font or break paragraphs down into sentences presented on single lines.

Why: Making text less dense is a recommended strategy for students with language-based learning disabilities, like dyslexia, but is also helpful for students with poor vision, neurodiverse students who are easily overwhelmed by too much information on a page, and readers with low frustration tolerance who look at a paragraph and don't know where to start.²

4. Use Different Modalities to Review the Same Information (Content / Process)

What: Vary your activities so that the same vocabulary

and stories are being reviewed with different modalities. Keep a spreadsheet to track how often you use activities that offer movement, solitary paperwork, group work, or visual or listening activities, making sure you don't lean too heavily on one kind of activity. Common ways to incorporate movement can be found on sites and in resources regarding Total Physical Response (TPR). Many teachers use ASL signs and adapted gestures to tie visual reception and motor response to the meanings of vocabulary words. To further incorporate visuals, you can also use student actors, have students play games like charades or talk about pictures or movies, use props, or have students draw to show their understanding of a text.

Why: Research on "learning styles" or types of intelligences is controversial, with researchers who support the idea and researchers who critique it.³ Researchers don't dispute, however, that students benefit from a classroom where information is presented to them in a variety of ways. Teachers are therefore encouraged to include activities with visuals, listening, group work, and movement. As has been demonstrated, movement benefits everyone by increasing blood flow to the brain (Sousa and Tomlinson, 137-161). For those interested in techniques associated with CI, using such a variety of activities also provides more repetition of vocabulary for better retention.

Resources: Two sites that have many relevant and useful ideas compiled in one place are Keith Toda's, http://todallycomprehensiblelatin.blogspot.com/p/ci-reading-strategies.html and Eleanor Arnold's, http:// www.latinteachertoolbox.com/techniques.html. The website https://www.tpr-world.com/ has many resources about Total Physical Response (TPR) from the originator, Dr. James Asher, whose book, *Learning Another Language Through Actions*, has a detailed explanation of the methodology, as well as sample lessons. Rachel Ash and Miriam Patrick have a blog post where they offer materials for TPR instruction useful for Latin 1: http:// pomegranatebeginnings.blogspot.com/2016/08/the-first-ten-tpr-in-two-weeks.html.

5. Embedded / Tiered Reading (Content)

What: Tiered or embedded readings present the same text at different levels of complexity. Often a teacher begins with an unadapted or otherwise challenging text and then scales it down to easier and easier versions. Readers begin with the simple version and then work their way up to more difficult versions. Often each tier contains key details that were left out of the previous tier to help hold student interest. Tiered reading isn't useful only in an upper-level class where students are reading an authentic Latin text. Allyson Spencer-Bunch often presents her Latin 1 or 2 students with a very short and simple tier 1 version of a story that introduces new vocabulary. Then the class reads a longer version of the story. Spencer-Bunch will also sometimes present students with both tiers at the same time, and let students pick individually whether to go straight to tier 2 or read tier 1 first. Giving students choice is a consistent theme in discussions of DI. In her college Latin courses, particularly in poetry courses, Teresa Ramsby presents simplified, prose versions of whole poems on PowerPoints with images to corroborate meaning, and then, after students have demonstrated an understanding of the basic meaning and some of the major interpretive points of the poem, presents the original text with introduction of the remaining stylistic, metrical, content-related, and interpretive issues.

Why: For all students to read a text successfully, i.e., understand what they are reading, it is ideal if at least 90% of the vocabulary is known to them.⁴ When reading unadapted texts, this is often challenging. Tiered readings, in whatever way these are formulated, help make the unadapted reading accessible by familiarizing students with the overall content and the vocabulary before they try to approach the original text.

Resources: The website "Fluency Matters" by Laurie Clarcq and Michelle Whaley contains a wealth of information on and examples of embedded reading: https://embeddedreading.com/. Kevin Ballestrini and the team at the Pericles Group offer tiered readings of Caesar and Vergil: https://lapis.practomime.com/index.php/operation-caesar-reading-list. Robert Amstutz provides tiered readings of Catullus, Horace, and Ovid in his volume, Carmina Amoris: a Tiered Reader; and Andrew Olimpi provides tiered versions of Ovid and Hyginus in his volume, Daedalus and Icarus: a Tiered Latin Reader; both are available on Amazon. In addition, Lindsay Sears gave a presentation at the Classical Association of New England's 2018 annual meeting on working with tiered readings, which Lance Piantaggini discusses favorably and briefly on his blog: https://magisterp.com/2018/03/19/lindsay-sears-on-tiers/.

6. Provide Alternatives Within Creative Writing Activities (Product / Affect)

What: Allow students to take an English text and put it into Latin or to describe a picture instead of writing their own story.

Why: Creative writing can be an effective way for students to demonstrate the Latin they know on topics that interest them. One way to do this is a method suggested by Robert Patrick (Parkview High School, GA): the "One Word at a Time Story" has students choose new words or phrases from slips of paper and incorporate them into a story. Students will write according to their own ability and the result of this activity is a number of student-created stories that can be used at other times in the class. Be aware, however, that there are neurodiverse students for whom creative writing can provoke anxiety and they may have to be directed to another activity.

Resources: Patrick explains the "One Word at a Time Story" (OWATS) activity in this blogpost: https://lat-inbestpracticescir.wordpress.com/2015/02/17/owats-one-word-at-a-time-stories/.

7. Provide Resources for Self-Paced Home Study (Process / Affect)

What: Consider making class resources available for students to go over at home. Allyson Spencer-Bunch doesn't use a textbook, so she provides a Google Drive folder with all of the stories read in class and prepares an online review or memorization exercise with all of the class vocabulary. She provides internet links to extra materials for students who want to engage with Latin in a different way, such as the Latin options on Duolingo (https://www.duolingo.com/learn), or the many videos on YouTube presenting Latin songs, presentations in Latin, and movies with Latin subtitles.

Teresa Ramsby uploads pdf versions of her Power-Point lectures on her university's web-based platform (Moodle) for download. She places these lectures on the platform after class, but for students with documented disabilities she provides them in advance of class so that the students can write their notes on the slides themselves. For a recent Roman Civilization lecture course, Ramsby also allowed her lectures to be recorded on Echo 360, a video-based platform, whereby students could see her lectures, if missed or for review.

Why: For most students, repetition is helpful. Studyat-home options can provide a way to lower anxiety for students who prefer to have multiple opportunities for study and review. These consistent resources provide a structured way to catch up for students with chronic health issues that cause them to miss school often. Students with and without diagnosed disabilities often need aid in the learning process, and these auxiliary study opportunities ease the absorption of material and strengthen students' abilities to demonstrate their understanding.

C. Assessment in the DI Latin Classroom: Differentiation hinges on an accurate understanding of students' abilities and knowledge, which makes consistent, frequent formative assessment a key part of a differentiated classroom. The document, "Standards for Classical Language Learning," is a good place to look to see what stated abilities and outcomes correspond to what level of Latin proficiency as you set goals and develop assessments to measure those goals.⁵ Each aspect of the standards includes charts that match "Global Statements" to "Sample Indicators." In other words, learning goals are matched up with specific tasks that students who have learned this material should be able to do. Many online resources generate summative assessments for teachers, such as Plickers, Quizlet Classroom, and Google forms, all of which make computer-graded multiple choice and short answer quizzes. Formative assessments can take myriad forms: short mini-quizzes at the end of class, mini-whiteboard activities, activities that demonstrate students' knowledge, and listening in on partner conversations as students work in groups. Allyson Spencer-Bunch speaks of what she refers to as "assessment-eavesdropping" in this way when circulating among student groups: "I'll make sure to listen to a representative sample of my fastest processors, my students who are most likely to be stuck, as well as some students in the middle. That way, in a few minutes, I can gather the data I need to know how much scaffolding is needed for whatever text I want to read next."

Assessment, like so many topics discussed in this article, manifests in a variety of ways depending on the methods of the teacher, the disposition of the students, the goals of the teacher or school, and so forth. The list below presents six ways you can modify the types of assessments you use, the way your assessments are approached, or the way you facilitate success for your students before, during, or after an assessment.

1. Allow Choices for Quizzes (Product)

What: If there are multiple ways that students could show their understanding of a text, give them a choice. To demonstrate comprehension of a Latin text, a teacher could allow students to render the actions in pictures, to translate, or to answer comprehension questions. A teacher could allow students to answer orally instead of in writing. In advance of a quiz, a teacher could ask students to identify the vocabulary words they would like to see glossed for their benefit. In addition, a teacher could give credit for knowledge the teacher hasn't requested, with a question such as: "what do you know about this topic (or story) that I didn't ask you?"

Why: Students will convey their understanding more accurately if they can do it in a way suited to their needs and abilities.

2. Test Retakes (Product)

What: Allow students to retake assessments and achieve a better grade.

Why: Allowing students to retake all assessments accomplishes three things. First, it reduces anxiety around tests so that students can focus on the task without worrying that a poor performance will hurt their grade. Second, it allows the grade that students receive at the end of the quarter to reflect growth they made during the quarter. Third, if the teacher requires students to attend sessions of review with them before doing the retake, this method ensures individualized teaching to students who haven't received enough input in class.

3. Offer Structured Alternatives for Competitive Review (Affect)

What: For group competitive review games, provide an alternative way for students to engage with the task being practiced. You can let students write down translations or answers on a mini-whiteboard, draw pictures to show understanding, hold up a true / false card, or identify pictures.

Why: For anxious students or students who have struggles with peers, these activities that are supposed to be fun can raise the level of anxiety, in response to the public and performative aspect of the game, to the point where students aren't benefiting from the review. These modifications allow students to review the same content and still give instant feedback about what they understand.

4. Use Benchmark Writing to show Student Progress (Product)

What: Many teachers using methods associated with Active Latin / Comprehensible Input achieve differentiation by using benchmark writing assessments, often in the form of "timed writes." The purpose of these is to see what vocabulary and structure students have acquired by having them write in Latin. The details vary by teacher. Some give a short amount of time (5-10 minutes) for students to write, where others give a whole period; some ask students to retell a familiar story, while others request that students create their own story to make the task less dependent on recall. One approach is to provide a list of all the Latin words the students have learned so far in the class (with no English translations), to prompt those who have a hard time getting started on their writing. Whatever structure you provide, the goal is to get a baseline sense of what vocabulary and grammatical forms students have internalized. Rather than being compared to other students, each student is invited to track their own progress over time. Many teachers have students create graphs to track how many words they're writing. Students can also use a rubric modeled on the standards levels to see how their text complexity evolves over time.

Why: Everyone is able to be successful, but all students still have room to grow and push themselves.

Resources: Many resources exist for setting up timed writes, including templates that students can use to keep track of their word count. This site provides much information on the topic: http://teachingcomprehensibly. com/timed-writing/. Tina Hargaden has created rubrics to measure student writing and encourage students to push their writing to the next level, and these rubrics are available on her Facebook group "CI Liftoff," and on her website: https://ci-liftoff.teachable.com/.

5. Modifications to Assessments (Product)

What: Sometimes students have specific modifications to the curriculum spelled out in their Individualized Education Programs (IEPs). Sometimes accommodation means providing more time for an assessment, or having an assessment read to the student, or providing assessments on a computer rather than on paper. Assessments can be differentiated as well. For example, if the standard assessment requires students to conjugate and translate a verb, the modified assessment has a completed verb chart and requires students to use the chart to choose the correct translation of verb forms. The translation sections can be modified so that each sentence is broken down word by word with a space for the students to define each word, and then a larger space for them to translate the whole sentence to help them slow down and break the sentence down. Gregory Stringer shared that he sometimes provides a word bank on a vocabulary quiz to one group of learners and expects another group to provide the words themselves.

Why: These accommodations reduce the mental load and allow students who would otherwise not be able to provide any information to show you what they do know.

6. Create An Honors Option Within One Room (Process / Content / Product)

There are many options for teachers who teach honors and non-honors sections within the same class period, or for teachers who wish to create some kind of honors option to challenge students. Teachers with multi-level classrooms are advised to work with their school's administration to make sure material is compliant with issues of equity and access for all. Yet it cannot be denied that multi-level classes demand that teachers differentiate assessment formats and content. Will Roundy (Amherst High School, MA) puts extra questions on his quizzes that only honors students are required to answer; the quiz is otherwise the same for both groups. His honors students also have an extra text with a reading comprehension quiz every two to three weeks, with 30-80 lines. While honors students are required to take these extra quizzes, they are also open to non-honors students for extra credit. Kelsie Toy (Lynnfield High School, MA) has no formal honors program, but she places students into groups based on their first vocabulary and reading quiz of the year. Students in all groups read the same texts but are held to different standards of accuracy and detail on vocabulary and reading quizzes. More advanced students offer tutoring sessions for students in other groups, and both tutees and tutors receive extra credit for attending these sessions.

Conclusion:

As the authors of this piece have demonstrated, differentiated instruction can take many forms. This article presents a summary of strategies, some representative of ideas that you could implement right away, and some representative of larger methodological shifts that may require more planning. We hope that the bibliography below and the resources referenced within the article are useful in discovering more about changes you can envision in your own classroom.

Like any major revision of methods in the classroom, differentiated instruction requires time and space for innovations to be developed and practiced. The authors hope that this article may provide you and your teaching colleagues with the opportunity to raise this issue with your administration: namely, that the implementation of identified best practices will need professional development discussions, workshops, and continued conversation as methods gradually emerge in the classroom. We hope that your administrators will see the value in dedicating scheduled professional development hours for these and other related methods to be discussed and worked out in ways relevant to all disciplines. The authors do not believe that differentiated instruction is something you should have to do all on your own and without support, and we encourage you to seek out ways that your learning community can take part in this equitable approach to teaching and learning.⁶

NOTES

¹See especially Tomlinson (1995 [republished 2001]) and (1999); Tomlinson and McTighe (2006); and Tomlinson and Imbeau (2010).

²See Ashe (1997) *passim*, for an extensive approach to accommodating students with disabilities in the Latin classroom.

³Sousa and Tomlinson (2010) 146: "Some highly respected researchers . . . argue vigorously for the existence of cognitive styles, or intelligence preferences. At the same time, other noted psychologists . . . argue with equal fervor that the construct of cognitive style or intelligence preference is ill informed and makes little sense in terms of learning." In Willingham, Hughes, and Dobolyi (2015), for example, the authors are critical of the notion that individuals think and learn best in different ways (learning styles theories): "There is reason to think that people view learning styles theories as broadly accurate, but, in fact, scientific support for these theories is lacking." Alternatively, Terada (2018) addresses the valid aspects of Howard Gardner's theories of "multiple intelligences," proposed in his 1983 book, but their misapplication by educators.

⁴Schmitt, Jiang, and Grabe (2011) 40: "The present study suggests that readers should control 98%–99% of a text's vocabulary to be able to read independently for comprehension."

⁵The final version of "Standards for Classical Language Learning" will be available soon, but until then, the 2017 draft of the revised standards provides definitions and descriptions of standards and helpful rubrics: https://www.aclclassics.org/Portals/0/Site%20Documents/Publications/Standards_for_Classical_Language_Learning_2017%20FINAL.pdf.

⁶The authors are grateful to all the educators quoted or cited in this article for their ideas, practices, and online resources. We especially thank the following teachers for their specific feedback: Emily Berardi, John Berneche, Mariah Lapiroff, Tara McKenna, Will Roundy, Hayden Schulingkamp, Gregory Stringer, and Kelsie Toy. Teresa wishes to thank Taylor Cassidy for her assistance in researching this article. The authors also thank Ronnie Ancona, as *CO* editor, and the two anonymous readers for *CO*, who provided helpful comments for improvement.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ashe, Althea. "Latin for Special Needs Students: Meeting the Challenge of Students with Learning Disabilities." In *Latin for the 21st Century: From Concept to Classroom*, edited by Richard Lafleur, 237-50. Boston: Addison and Wesley, 1997.
- Asher, James. *Learning Another Language Through Actions*. Los Gatos, CA: Sky Oak Productions, 2009.
- Blaz, Deborah. *Differentiated Instruction: A Guide for World Language Teachers*. New York and London: Routledge, Eye on Education, 2016.
- Gardner, Howard. Frames of Mind: The Theory of Multiple Intelligences. New York: Basic Books, 2011.
- King-Shaver, Barbara and Alyce Hunter. *Adolescent Literacy & Differentiated Instruction*. Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann, 2009.
- Krashen, Stephen. *Explorations in Language Acquisition and Use*. Portsmouth, NH: Heineman, 2003.
- Morin, Amanda. "Universal Design for Learning (UDL): What You Need to Know." Understood. org, 2014. https://www.understood.org/en/learningthinking-differences/treatments- approaches/educational-strategies/universal-design-for-learning-whatit-is-and-how-it-works (accessed January 8, 2020).
- Schmitt, Norbert, Xiangying Jiang, and William Grabe. "The Percentage of Words Known in a Text and Reading Comprehension." *The Modern Language Journal* 95.1 (2011): 26-43.
- Sousa, Davis A. and Carol Tomlinson. *Differentiation* and the Brain: How Neuroscience Supports the Learner-Friendly Classroom. Bloomington, IN: Solution Tree Press, 2010.
- Terada, Youki. "Multiple Intelligences Theory: Widely Used, Yet Misunderstood." Edutopia.org, 2018. https://www.edutopia.org/article/multiple-intelligences-theory-widely-used-yet-misunderstood (accessed March 6, 2020).
- Tomlinson, Carol Ann. *How to Differentiate Instruction in Mixed-Ability Classrooms*. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 1995 and 2001.

. The Differentiated Classroom: Responding to the Needs of All Learners. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 1999.

Tomlinson, Carol Ann and Jay McTighe. *Integrating Differentiated Instruction & Understanding by Design: Connecting Content and Kids.* Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 2006.

- Tomlinson, Carol Ann and Marcia Imbeau. *Leading and Managing a Differentiated Classroom*. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 2010.
- Willingham, Daniel T., Elizabeth M. Hughes, and David G. Dobolyi. "The Scientific Status of Learning Styles Theories." *Teaching of Psychology* 42 (2015): 266-271.

Teresa Ramsby is Associate Professor of Classics and the current director of the University of Massachusetts Amherst "Master of Arts in Teaching: Latin and Classical Humanities" program. Her research projects include studies of Ovid's poetry, Roman freed slaves, and Latin pedagogy.

Allyson Spencer-Bunch graduated from the University of Massachusetts Amherst "Master of Arts in Teaching: Latin and Classical Humanities" program in 2014. Allyson is currently the Latin teacher and World Language Department Chair at John F. Kennedy Middle School in Northampton, Massachusetts.

"A large part of progress is wanting to progress."

Inner Citadel Tutoring offers bespoke courses of study in ancient Greek and Latin, using online one-to-one tutoring and incorporating research on emotional intelligence, language acquisition & mindfulness pedagogies. Peter Anderson is a nationally awarded teacher with international curriculum experience in classical languages.

Specializing in IB classical languages curriculum. Consulting for teachers interested in ongoing professional study, development and training.

The rest of progress is work, and work needs support.

Notice. Engage. Empo Emotional Intelligence Dialogue Facilitation





Go to suburani.com to order now